



International Journal of Institutional Leadership, Policy and Management
Volume 2, Issue 4, pp. 855-877. 2020

ISSN: 2735-9220

www.ijilpm.com.ng



INSTRUCTIONAL SUPERVISION AND TEACHERS' JOB PERFORMANCE IN PUBLIC SENIOR SECONDARY SCHOOLS IN RIVERS STATE

Helen N. L. NWANKWOALA
Department of Educational Management
Ignatius Ajuru University of Education, Nigeria
nwankwoalahelen@yahoo.com

ABSTRACT

Educational management and administration at all levels require supervision or close monitoring of all educational personnel, activities and facilities to ensure the attainment of set educational goals. It is in the light of this that this study investigated the relationship between instructional supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. The study adopted a correlation design. A sample size of 347 persons were obtained from a population of 7,145 teachers in the two hundred and seventy eight (278) public senior secondary schools in Rivers State with the use of stratified random sampling technique. Implicitly, 5% of the entire population was used for the study. The instruments for data collection were self-constructed questionnaire titled; Instructional Supervision Questionnaire (ISQ) and Teacher Job Performance Questionnaire (TJPQ). These instruments were validated by three researchers' colleagues in the department of educational management of Ignatius Ajuru University of Education. The reliability of the instruments were determined by using test re-test method of data collection. The said instruments were administered on 30 teachers outside the sample population and the collected responses were analyzed using Crombach Alpha technique as a measure of internal consistency. The reliability indexes of 0.87 and 0.89 were obtained indicating that the instruments were very reliable. Mean and standard deviation were used to test the hypotheses and linear regression statistical tool was used to test the hypotheses using SPSS package, version 22. Based on the analyses, the following findings were made; classroom visitation by supervisors, clinical supervision technique and holding conferences with teachers by supervisors before the actual classroom observation are significantly related to teachers' job performance. The study therefore concluded that supervision is a vital aspect of school administration, and thus recommended that the school administrators and supervisors from the Schools Board should regularly conduct supervision in schools to ensure maximum growth of teachers in their job.

Keywords: Instructional Supervision, Teachers' Job Performance, Educational Administration, Educational Management.

Reference to this paper should be made as follows:

Nwankwoala, H. N. L. (2020). Instructional supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. *International Journal of Institutional Leadership, Policy and Management*, 2(4), 855-877.

Copyright © IJILPM 2020.

INTRODUCTION

Supervision can be regarded as the hub of school administration in the sense that every activity which is directed toward the achievement of educational goals within the school system must be monitored and supervised. School administrators are often saddled with the responsibilities of overseeing all the activities of schools. They have the duties to ensure that school plants are managed and carefully used. They ensure that instructional procedures, curriculum contents, and teaching methods are strictly followed by teachers. School administrators are expected to ensure that students are taught or exposed to the prescribed learning experiences in line with the curriculum. The learning environment must be kept safe for both students and teachers. School principals and headmasters are to ensure that appropriate instructional materials must be employed by teachers during lesson delivery to enable students have better understanding of the lessons they are taught. When teachers teach with inadequate teaching aids, or even without teaching aids, students most times find it difficult to understand the lesson contents and eventually may fail their examination.

Supervision can be seen as the process of providing leadership to the teacher or even non-teaching staff in a school system. It involves directing, assisting, motivating and encouraging teachers towards the attainment of set instructional objectives. Teachers are regarded as the most important tool in the attainment of set instructional objectives. Supervision means different things to different people depending on their perception of the concept. This accounts for why persons like Scott (1999), Barnad (2001), Forster (2004), Ijaduola (2000) cited in Leigha (2010) see supervision as the attempt to oversee, direct and control the activities of subordinates, but other authors such as Merfon (2002), Selznick (2002), Fafioye (2004), Nwokafor (2005) and Marchand (2006) also cited in Leigha (2010) perceive supervision as an auxiliary relationship between super-ordinates and their subordinates. All these imply that supervision has to do with giving direction and control to a subordinate staff by the superior staff.

Educational supervision in the view of Abama (2002) is those phases of school administration which focus primarily on the achievement of appropriate instructional expectations of an educational system. This implies that educational supervision involves the close monitoring and direction of all the activities within the school system that aim at ensuring that educational goals are achieved. In the same vein Ogunu (1998) defined educational supervision as the art of overseeing the activities of teachers and other educational workers in a school system to ensure that they conform with generally accepted principles and practice of education.

School principals and headmasters have the authority to control the education system, and provide professional guidance to school personnel as to improve the conditions which affect the learning and growth of students and teachers. Some educational activities that must be regularly supervised include; instructional activities, teaching methods, school plants, curriculum content, facilities, buildings and equipment. When all these are given proper supervision, educational goals are normally achieved without hitches.

Educational supervision has been seen as a vital action towards making teachers perform well in their jobs. This is part of the reason why Federal Republic of Nigeria (2014) in section 9 sub-section 137 of the National Policy on Education stated that ‘the objectives of planning, administrative, supervisory and financial services in education are to:

- Provide efficient administrative and management control for the maintenance and improvement of the system;
- Ensure quality assurance through regular and continuous supervision of instructional and other educational services ...

In other words supervision of instruction guarantees quality assurance in education. As such, teachers as well as other educational workers must be closely supervised regularly. There have been so many studies carried out in the area of the relationship between educational supervision and teachers' job performance. Sudarjat et al. (2015) conducted a study on Supervision, Leadership and working motivation of teachers' performance and discovered that supervision can boost the performance of teachers up to 72.4%, leadership can help teachers up to 72% and working motivation helps them up to 77.2%. The study therefore concluded among other things that there is a positive relationship between regular supervision of teachers and their job performance.

Esia-Donkoh and Baffoe (n.d) also carried out a study on the supervisory practices of head teachers and how these supervisory practices relate with teacher motivation in public schools in the Anomabo Education Circuit of the Mfantseman Municipality in the Central Region of Ghana. It was found that head teachers in the Anomabo Education Circuit often used all the instructional supervisory practices outlined in the study and they performed above average. The orientation of new teaching staff and the provision of in-service training for teachers were some of the supervisory practices adopted in the study, while the orientation of new teachers' supervisory practices was dominant; the in-service training for teachers was rarely carried out. The study therefore recommended that the Mfantseman Municipal Directorate of Ghana Education service should organize regular in-service training programmes for head teachers in public basic schools in the Anomabo Education Circuit to improve their skills to effectively balance and practice very high teacher motivation.

Jared (2011) also carried a research on the influence of head teachers' influence of instructional supervisory practices on teachers' work performance in secondary schools in Entebbe Municipality, Wakiso District, Uganda. The study findings indicate that head teachers in private secondary schools do not carry out instructional supervision; rather they do some informal classroom visits. They equally do general and informal supervision instead of instructional supervision. In line with this, the findings indicate that 64.3% of head teachers routinely supervise their teachers 'teaching documents as a practice of teacher supervision, while 57.1% of head teachers informally visit teachers during classroom instruction. Also, this study revealed that supervision is non-existent in some secondary schools due to the fact that some of the teachers have been teaching for many years.

Obviously, a close examination of these studies cited above shows that there have been serious concerns about the extent instructional supervision can influence teachers' work performance in many countries. This is as a result of the fact that teachers need regular supervision to enable them perform well in their teaching job. To best of the researchers' knowledge, such study may not have been carried out in Rivers State, hence the need for the present study on instructional supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

Statement of the Problem

Despite the vital nature of instructional supervision in improving, students' learning, teachers' efforts and job performance as well as the attainment of educational goals, there has been noticeable nonchalant attitude of head teachers as well as supervisory officials in the education sector toward the task of supervision of schools in Rivers State. It is equally obvious that head teachers of public secondary schools in the State do not conduct regular supervision of instruction in their schools. Teachers' are left to do whatever they like. Some of the teachers in public secondary schools even engage in full time university programme to acquire higher degrees at the expense of their jobs. Some even connive with their principals and subject heads to abandon their classrooms lessons while they do their private businesses.

Worst still is the situation whereby supervisors from the ministry of education take bribes from school heads and teachers in other not to visit school for supervision. Thanks for the resent move by the state commissioner of education who took it upon himself to visit schools personally to ensure that teachers and school heads are physically present in schools. Yet in his absence teachers and head teachers still do whatever they like. It was based this situation that this study speculated that poor supervisory practices may have serious influence on teachers' job performance, as portrayed by students' poor performance in both internal and external examination, un-kept school environments, students' misconducts within and outside school premises and a host of other ills caused by poor instructional supervision. It is in this light that this study investigates the relationship between instructional supervision and teachers' job performance in Rivers State.

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

This study adopted the developmental model of supervision as proposed by Stoltenberg, McNeill, and Delworth in 1998. Developmental model of supervision is of the notion that individuals are continuously growing. They explained developmental model with three levels of supervisees: beginning, intermediate and advanced. This model is related to the present study in the sense that supervision in the school system helps in the professional development of teachers and with time they have efficient job performance. Below is tabulated explanation of a developmental model of supervision in line with this model:

Table 1: Developmental Model of Supervision

Advanced
The teacher at this stage exhibits stable motivation. Has confidence in his/her capacity to learn. Thus he is developing a life-long motivation to ongoing professional development.
Intermediate
The teacher starts to gain confidence in his or herself. He/she can be quite assertive and begin to follow his/her own agenda. Functions more independently and may only want requested specific help.
Beginner
The teacher at this beginning state focuses on the acquisition of teaching skills, is highly motivated and has high anxiety. He/she needs minimal challenge, and is very dependent on the supervisor.

Concept of Educational Supervision

Supervision as a concept derived its meaning from a Latin word ‘super-video’ meaning ‘to oversee’. This implies that the process of supervision entails the act of a superior officer overseeing the activities or functions of the subordinate. It involves close monitoring and giving directives; motivation and encouragement given to a subordinate to enable the individual perform his/her assigned tasks. In the school system, educational supervision also known as instructional supervision is the process through which supervisors from the Ministry of education as well as school principals and headmasters monitor, direct, control and motivate classroom teachers during teaching and learning activities to enable them achieve the set instructional objectives and goals.

Of course, many educationists perceive educational supervision from different angles. Some see it a way of assisting teachers to achieve their lesson objectives, while some still see it as a way of offering strict leadership to teachers and even non teaching staff in the school system. This was why Good (1945) cited in Ogunu (2000, p. 107) defined educational supervision as “all efforts of designated school officials directed towards providing leadership to teachers and other educational workers in the improvement of instruction; it involves the stimulation of professional growth and development of teachers, the selection and revision of educational objectives, materials of instruction, and methods of teaching, and the evaluation of instruction”.

The above definition of educational supervision connotes the modern practice of supervision which focuses on the professional growth of teachers and the improvement of the instructional process. This is different from the old practice of supervision or inspection that focused on finding faults with teachers and their teaching methods. It is in line with this that Moorer also cited in Ogunu (2000) opined that the term supervision is used to describe those activities which are primarily and directly concerned with studying and improving the conditions or environments of learning as well as the growth of pupils and teachers. Supervision is indeed the hub of school administration. It is the centre of educational management and without it administrators find the attainment of educational goals difficult. Oyewole and Ehinola (2014) supporting this stated that one important aspect of educational management is instructional supervision which they defined as the process of bringing about improvement in the teaching – learning process through a network of cooperative activities and democratic relationship of persons concerned with teaching and learning as to achieve effective education system. Supporting this view, Syaeful (2006) opined that supervision is an assisted effort given to teachers while performing their professional duties so that they can help students to learn better. Therefore, supervision can be described as an assistance given to teachers in the development of better learning. It is an activity that is offered to help teachers carry out their duties as to become more optimal. It is in this sense that, educational supervision is seen as having a function to direct, coordinate, develop, guide and organize teachers in achieving the objectives set out in the school.

Meaning of Teachers’ Job Performance

Performance is a yard-stick to measure an accomplished goal. In the view of Rue and Byars (2007) performance implies how well an employee meets the requirements and demands of his

or her job. In the real sense, the employee's performance is determined by three main factors: effort, ability, and direction. Effort entails how hard a person works; ability implies an effort that matches one's ability, and direction has to do with how well the individual understands what the job expects from him/her. This implies that the performance will be realized when the process of achievement supported by these three factors that function together. If the teacher fails to possess any of these factors, his or her performance will be low.

This was why Sudarjat, Abdullah and Unaryo (2015) opined that a teacher who has a high performance is the result of combination of how much efforts he/her put in carrying out the work, his or her competency to do the job as well as the extent to which the purpose of the work is understood. The basic principles in job performing is upholding honesty, conducting maximum learning process, having high sense of responsibility, having clear objectives, concentrating on results, cooperating, working continuously, and always making continuous improvement. It was in the line with this that Schermerhon, Hunt, Osborn and Uhi-Bien (2010) earlier explained that the performance is much influenced directly by (1) the individual attributes such as the ability and experience, (2) organizational support such as resources and technology, and (3) business or a person's willingness to work hard at any job. Indeed the high performance of a teacher cannot be separated from the influence of the school head, other teachers, stakeholders and a very strong effort from individuals themselves.

Therefore, teachers' job performance entails the ability of teachers to accomplish set educational objectives and goals within specified time limit using appropriate tools and teaching methods. The supervision of teachers' instructional activities by head teachers and supervisors from the Ministry of education or Schools Board has great influence on their job performance. Teachers during instructional supervision acquire professional skills that enable them to accomplish expected tasks in their job. Also, the adoption of different techniques of supervision by supervisors enables teachers to improve their skills and invariably perform well in their job.

A Brief History of Instructional Supervision in Nigeria

The establishment of western education in the Western and south-Eastern parts of Nigeria by the Christian Missionaries between 1882 and 1914 no doubt metamorphosed into the establishment of government owned schools. The act of supervision was necessitated by the need to improve the proper coordination of these schools. The Colonial Government of Nigeria in 1877 enacted the first Ordinance to control education by the appointment of an Assistant Inspector of Education for the British West African Colony. Also in 1926, the ordinance made it compulsory for voluntary agencies to appoint their own supervisory staff. In 1929 according to Udoh and Akpa (2001), the Colonial government appointed visiting and supervisory staff. The 1952 constitution as recorded by Abama (2002) brought into being Ministries of Education for the three regions- East, West and North. In 1957, 1958 and 1959 an inspectorate divisions were set up in the West, East and North respectively. The divisions were charged with the responsibility of school inspection with the intension of minimizing the declining standard of education. Despite all these Phelps-Stroke report of 1962 noted that for more than forty-five years of the establishment of these schools, they lacked coordination and organization.

Udoh and Akpa (2001) also noted that in line with the Mustard report of 1972, subject inspectors were appointed in the various states. They were to inspect teachings and text books in their respective fields and forward the reports of their inspection to the headquarters. It was in

the light of this that Fafunwa (1974, p. 186) as well opined that the inspectorate division of the Ministries of education had the following responsibilities:

- General inspection of schools;
- Inspection of teachers' instructional work;
- Recommendation of set-books;
- Organization and conduct of in-service training programmes for teachers
- Research in education, for example curriculum improvement;
- Educational planning.

Fafunwa (1974) also noted that the inspectorate has no executive powers. It rather played an advisory role to the administrators. The inspectorate was responsible for zonal divisions. Each zone was headed by a Principal Inspector who was responsible to headquarters. Its headquarters were in the Ministry under the Chief Inspector of Education aided by an Assistant Chief Inspector of Education.

As time went on the conduct of inspection which was mainly based on the attitude of inspectors finding faults with teachers and head teachers as these inspectors visited the schools without prior notification, began to be abhorred by the teachers, principals and headmasters. The inspectors had assumed that since teachers were not properly trained, they needed to be subjected to constant supervision and training. These inspectors therefore visited the schools as lords and masters, instead of as partners in progress who had the development of the teachers and the educational process as their priority.

The agitation of the teachers and school heads against this mood of inspection resulted in the change of inspection to the concept of supervision. The modern supervision is seen as democratic, directive, and the process of helping teachers to develop professionally in their job. Supporting this view Abama (2002), opined that modern supervision, is positively oriented, democratic, objective in nature, creative and systematic in approach. There is now a more friendly approach to supervision against what used to be. The challenging situation of the school system in the light of increases in students enrolment rate, indiscipline problems of students, teacher development programmes, insufficient funds for running the schools and a host of other difficulties have compelled school heads mount effective supervisory programmes that are based on the principles of modern supervision.

Importance of Educational Supervision

To achieve maximally set goals of any organization there must be provision for supervision. As such the importance of supervision in any organization cannot be over-emphasized. Supervision in education system is focused generally on the improvement of the entire education system. Specifically educational supervision strives to:

- Ensure that recommended standards are maintained during instruction/teaching and learning;
- Provide room for constructive advice and purposeful directives that contribute to the improvement of pedagogical process;
- Help teachers acquire expected professional skills and growth;

- Solve instructional problems, like students' indiscipline, truancy among teachers, mismanagement of educational resources and misappropriation of funds by school heads and teachers;
- Ensure that newly employed teachers from faculties and colleges of education are properly guided during teaching since they may not have acquired all the techniques and methodology of instruction during their period of training as student-teachers, or during the teacher education programmes;
- Guide teachers in the selection of the content and appropriate methodology of teaching new subjects that are introduced in the curriculum;
- To bring to the awareness of teachers various resources that can help improve their teaching capabilities;
- Help teachers combat the problems of increased student enrollment rate, such as indiscipline and stress of class control;
- To provide adequate leadership to teachers prior, during and after instruction;
- Create a physical, social and psychological climate or environment favourable for learning;
- Help teachers discover problems and needs of learners and to solve these problems as well as provide for their needs.

Types of Supervision of Instruction

Supervision in the view of Nwankwoala (2016) has two major types: external and internal. External supervision which can be called inspection is the type conducted by officials from Schools Board or Ministry of Education. They focus on the extent to which school comply with the prescribed or established educational standards as recommended in the National Policy on Education (2014). External supervision may be in the form of; full general inspection, recognition inspection, follow up inspection and advisory visits. On the other hand there is also internal supervision which is normally conducted by school principals and headmasters or even teachers within the school compound. The focus of this type of supervision is to ensure that school activities and school plants are in proper use. The most important aspect of internal supervision is the instructional supervision. During the instructional supervision school administrators usually ensure that teachers adhere strictly to pedagogical methods as to effectively achieve educational objectives.

In this era of modern supervision, the supervisor works hand in hand with the teacher to achieve educational objectives. Initially, supervision used to be task-oriented. It centred on the teacher and the classroom. But, in this era of modern supervision, the focus is on the attainment of set educational goals which is students' learning. Supervisors are now friendlier with the teachers. Modern supervision according to Nwankwoala, (2016) therefore focuses on assisting principals and teachers in educating school children, helping teachers in the course of their professional growth, exhibiting cooperative spirit for team work, showing how best to use teaching materials, directing teachers on how to improve on the appropriate teaching methods, helping teachers to adopt proper methods of evaluating students, helping in curriculum improvement as well as assisting teachers on how to plan their work and evaluating themselves.

Techniques of Supervision

There are some recommended techniques that could be adopted in the supervision of instruction. Some of them are:

- Classroom visitation: this is a process whereby the supervisor observes the teacher during lesson delivery. The supervisor aims at observing the entire classroom activities as to gather information that would help in solving instructional problems of both the teacher and learners
- Conference with Teachers- this is a situation whereby the supervisor arranges to have conference with the teachers before visiting them in the classroom. The essence is to get relevant information from the teachers that will help the supervisor in observing the teacher well in the classroom. Also, during conferencing, the supervisor tries to build a positive relationship with the teachers that help them to relax and do their work.
- Demonstration Technique- this involves supervisor planning and carrying out teaching practice in order to expose teachers to innovations in teaching. The supervisor demonstrates these innovative methodologies and skills in teaching while the teachers observe.
- Group supervision- this technique involves a supervisor supervising a team of teachers teaching one class. He watches them take their turn one after the other. The supervisor allows the teachers to learn from one another's mistakes.
- Micro-teaching technique- this technique is one of the modern method of supervision. In using this technique, the supervisor makes use of video tape recorders (VTR) to record all the activities of teaching and learning process. When the video is played back, it serves as a feedback to the supervisor, the teacher and the students. This helps the teachers to discover their mistakes.
- Conferencing with Teachers- this is a situation whereby supervisors arrange to have conferences with teachers before the actual classroom observation. The essence of such conferences is to enable the supervisor gather necessary information about the teacher that would help his observation. It also helps the supervisor to know the type of feedback that should be given to the teacher after supervision. Obviously, the process of conferencing with teachers creates basis for establishing good relationship between the supervisor and the teachers.
- Clinical supervision technique- the use of this technique involves using the classroom as a clinic whereby, both the supervisor and the teacher sit down to diagnose teaching learning problems, provide remedies or offer solutions to such problems. Adiele (1977) opined that clinical supervision is a form of instructional supervision which gets its data from direct observation of actual teaching learning situation. This involves face to face interaction between the supervisor and the teacher in the analysis of instructional problems for the purposes of instructional improvement. Initially, clinical supervision was developed by Harvard professors known as Morris Cogan and Robert Anderson and their graduate students. Clinical supervision blended elements of "objective" and "scientific" classroom observation with aspects of collegial coaching, rational planning, and a flexible, inquiry-based concern with student learning. Cogan cited in Oku et al. (2008) opined that clinical supervision in its original sense consists of seven steps:

- Establishing the teacher –supervisor relationship;
- Planning with teachers;
- Planning the strategy of observation;
- Analyzing the teaching learning strategies;
- Planning the strategy of instruction;
- The conference;
- Reviewed planning.

However, in 1969 Robert Gold hammer proposed the similar five-stage process in clinical supervision: (1) a pre-observation conference between supervisor and teacher concerning elements of the lesson to be observed, (2) classroom observation; actual classroom visitation, (3) a supervisors analysis of notes from the observation, and planning for the post-observation conference. This entails the process of the supervisor making some comments based on what was observed during the teaching learning activities, (4) a post-observation conference between supervisor and teacher, and (5) a supervisors analysis of the post-observation conference

Many practitioners in educational management are of the view that these stages have been reduced to three: (1) the pre-observation conference, (2) the observation, and (3) the post-observation conference. Nevertheless it is important to note that Cogan insisted on a collegial relationship focused on the teachers’ interest in improving student learning, and on a non-judgmental observation and inquiry process. Veloo et al. (2013) also posited that clinical supervision helps teachers to improve teaching learning to be more effective to enhance students understanding. They further stated that clinical supervision can also be used as guidance for teaching and learning improvement by school inspectorates. Supporting this view Feger et al. (2004) also opined that, Clinical supervision is a process by which a teacher receives individualized support to enhance their instruction in order to improve education for all students.

Roles of School Administrators in Instructional Supervision of Instruction

School administrators have unique roles to play in the conduct of supervision in schools as it is a vital tool in school management and administration. It is therefore the responsibility of school administrators to:

- Ensure that teachers are found at their classrooms as scheduled in the school time table.
- Always ensure the teachers write their lesson plans and lesson note;
- Encourage teachers to write their lesson plan in line with the prescribed scheme of work;
- Help teachers to maintain conducive learning environment;
- Help teachers to have access to required texts and other instructional materials;
- Discipline truant and erring teachers who fail to carry out their duties;
- Help teachers maintain class control;
- Expose teachers to conferences, workshops, seminars and in-service training that would enhance their performance;
- Help teachers to know some pedagogical innovations.

Olele (1985) cited in Adiele et al. (2010, p. 144) enumerated certain roles a supervisor should always play as follows:

- A friend to the teacher;
- A counselor;
- A motivator;
- A stimulator;
- An adviser;
- A contributor;
- An energizer;
- A facilitator;
- An aspirator;
- A colleague or partner in progress;
- A resource person; and
- A helper.

Abama (2002) also suggested strategic ways in which the school administrator's supervisory practices can enhance teachers' jobs as follows:

- Planning and the mechanics of text-book adoption, purchase of audio-visual aids, reference books and other instructional materials that can contribute to teacher satisfaction and improvement;
- Giving orientation and induction of new teachers and provision of special assistance to the beginning and needy teachers;
- Organizing workshops, seminars and conferences internally for teachers and encouraging them to attend same elsewhere to improve on what they already know and to keep abreast with current methods of teaching;
- Encouraging teachers to appreciate and practice inter-mural supervision, which is considered very important in teacher improvement through cooperation and collegial or self-supervision;
- The insistence on self-development of teachers.

A careful examination of the above reviewed literature shows that supervision of instruction as a vital tool in the hands of school administrators requires serious attention both by the school heads as well as the supervisors from the Schools Board. This is to ensure that set educational goals are achieved through efficient teacher performance.

Aim and Objectives of the Study

The general aim of this study was to investigate the extent to which supervision of instruction influence teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. Specifically, the objectives of the study were to:

- To investigate the influence of classroom visitation by supervisors on teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.
- To determine how clinical supervision aids teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

- To find out how conferencing with teachers by the supervisors before the actual classroom teaching influence teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

Research Questions

The following research questions guided this study:

- How does classroom visitation by supervisors influence teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State?
- In what ways do clinical supervision enhance teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State?
- How does holding conferences with teachers by supervisors influence their job performance in Public secondary schools in Rivers State.?

Hypotheses

The following null hypotheses guided the study and were tested at 0.05 level of significance.

- There is no significant relationship between classroom visitation by supervisors and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.
- There is no significant relationship between the use of clinical supervision technique and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.
- Conferencing with teachers do not significantly relate with teachers' Job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

METHODS

The study adopted correlation design. This is a design which investigates the relationships between variables. This study therefore sought to find out the relationship between supervision of instruction and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. The population of the study comprised of 7,142 teachers in the two hundred and seventy eight (278) senior public secondary schools in Rivers State (source: Planning, Research, and Statistics Department, Senior Secondary Schools Board, Port Harcourt, Rivers State,2020). A sample size of 347 teachers which represented 5 % of the total population was obtained using stratified simple random sampling technique. The instruments used for data collection were developed by the researcher and are titled 'Instructional Supervision Questionnaire (ISQ) and 'Teachers' Job Performance Questionnaire (TJPQ). The modified Likert point scale of Strongly agree (SA), Agree (A), Disagree (D), and Strongly Disagree (SD) with the scaling values of 4, 3, 2, and 1 respectively were used for the study.

The instruments were validated by experts in the field of Educational Management and Measurement and Evaluation. The reliability of the instruments were obtained by analyzing the data collected through test re-test of about 30 teachers outside the sample via Crombach Alpha technique as a measure of internal consistency. The reliability indexes showed 0.87 and 0.89 respectively. This indicated high internal consistencies of these instruments. Data were collected by the researcher with the help of research assistants, being post graduate students who were

trained by way of how they should collect the data with clear and précised instructions. A total of 357 copies of the instrument were administered but about 347 were retrieved, representing about 98% of retrieval. This may have been caused by some of the respondents not returning some of the copies of the instrument at the time of collection. Mean and standard deviation were used to answer the research questions with the criterion mean of 2.5 for decision making while linear regression was used to test the hypotheses at 0.05 level of significance.

RESULTS

This section focuses on the empirical presentation of data, data analysis, and summary of findings and discussion of findings.

Research Questions One: How does classroom visitation by supervisors influence teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State?

Table 2: Mean and Standard Deviation of how classroom visitation influence teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State

Items	N	Min.	Max.	Sum	Mean	SD	Decision
1) During classroom visitations supervisors are able to point out to teachers certain wrong methods of teaching they use.	347	2.00	4.00	1138.00	3.28	0.60	Agree.
2) Classroom visitation of supervisors helps teachers to know some innovations in teaching.	347	2.00	4.00	1180.00	3.40	0.63.	Agree
3) During classroom visitations, supervisors have the chances of seeing and correcting teachers' lesson plans and lesson notes.	347	2.00	4.00	1168.00	3.37	0..63	.Agree
4) Classroom visitation by supervisors helps to check truancy among teachers.	347	1.00	4.00	1156.00	3.33	0.84.	Agree
5) Visiting teachers during teaching by supervisor helps to detect their difficulties in class control.	347	1.00	4.00	1317.00	3.29	0.81	Agree
Criterion mean=2.50					3.33	0.70	Strongly Related
Cumulative mean=3.33							

Table 2 above showed the statistical analysis of respondents' answers to the research question one on item 1 with mean score of 3.28 and standard deviation of 0.60 which indicated strong relationship between classroom visitation and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. The responses on item 2 showed strong relationship with mean score of 3.40 and standard deviation of 0.63. The mean score of 3.37 and standard deviation of 0.63 showed strong relationship for item 3. The respondents mean score of 3.33 and standard deviation of 0.84 on item 4 showed strong relationships. The mean score of 3.29 and standard deviation of 0.81 on item 5 showed strong relationships. This showed that the majority

of the respondents agreed on their responses on research question one items that there is strong relationship between classroom visitation and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State with a cumulative average mean and standard deviation scores of 3.33 and 0.70. This is an indication that teachers' job performance depend on classroom visitation activities in schools.

Research Question 2: In what ways do clinical supervision enhance teachers' job performance in Public Senior secondary schools in Rivers State

Table 3: Mean and Standard Deviation analysis of the relationship between clinical supervision and teachers' job performance in Public Senior secondary school in Rivers State

Items	N	Min.	Max.	Sum	Mean	SD	Decision
6) The friendly nature of clinical supervision is an encouragement to teachers.		2.00	2.00	4.00	3.30	0.59	Related
7) The use of clinical supervision technique aids teachers not to be afraid during supervision.		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.17	0.69	Related
8) The use of clinical supervision technique helps supervisors to plan with the teachers.		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.27	0.70	Related
9) The use of clinical supervision technique helps supervisors and teachers to analyze the teaching learning strategies		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.22	0.66	Related
10) Using clinical supervision technique creates teacher and supervisor intimacy.		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.17	0.69	Related
Criterion mean=2.50					3.23	0.67	Strongly Related
Cumulative mean=3.23							Related

In the Table 3 above the respondents mean score and standard deviation of 3.30 and 0.59 on item 6 showed a strong relationship between clinical supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. Responses on item 7 with mean score of 3.17 and standard deviation of 0.69 showed strong relationship. The respondents' answers on item 8 with mean score of 3.27 and standard deviation of 0.70 also showed strong relationship. The mean score of 3.22 and standard deviation of 0.66 on item 9 showed strong relationship. Item 10 indicated strong relationship between mean score of 3.17 and standard deviation of 0.69. All the items showed a cumulative mean score of 3.23 and standard deviation of 0.67. This showed that the majority of the respondents agree that there is a strong relationship between clinical supervision and teachers' job performance in the public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. This therefore implies that clinical supervision of instruction is essential in aiding teachers' job performance.

Research Question 3: How does holding conferences with teachers by the supervisor influence their job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State?

Table 4: Mean and Standard Deviation of the influence of holding conferences with teachers by supervisor on their job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State

Items	N	Min.	Max.	Sum	Mean	SD	Decision
11) Having conference with teachers before and after classroom teaching learning process is needed for their professional growth.		2.00	2.00	4.00	3.45	0..56	Related
12) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor is one way of building positive relationship with them.		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.14	0..67	Related
13) Having conference with teachers before the actual classroom observation improves teachers skills		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.15	0.75	Related
14) Conferencing with teacher help supervisors to detect students and teachers classroom needs.		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.47	0.77	Related
14) Holding conferences with teachers by the supervisor give teachers sense of recognition in their job.		3.00	1.00	4.00	3.49	0.73	Related
Criterion mean=2.50					3.34	0.70	Strongly Related
Cumulative mean=3.34							Related

Table 4 above shows the mean score and standard deviation for item 11 as 3.34 and 0.56 respectively which indicated strong relationship. The responses on item 12 showed mean score of 3.14 and standard deviation of 0.67 which also indicated strong relationship. The respondent's answers on item 13 showed mean score as 3.15 and standard deviation of 0.75 which as well indicated strong relationship. The responses on item 14 showed mean score of 4.47 and standard deviation of 0.77 which still indicated strong relationship. The respondents' responses for item 15 equally showed mean score of 3.49 and standard deviation of 0.73 which was a strong relationship. The statistical analysis of respondents' answers to the research question three items with the cumulative average mean and standard deviation scores of 3.34 and 0.70 showed that the majority of the respondents agreed that there is a strong relationship between holding conferences with teachers by the supervisor and teachers' job performance in the public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. This result indicates that teachers who attain conferences organized by supervisors before the actual classroom supervision perform very well in their teaching exercise.

Hypothesis One (Ho₁): There is no significant relationship between classroom visitation and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State

Table 5: Linear Regression Analysis of the relationship between classroom visitation by supervisors and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State

		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		coefficients		Beta		
		B	Std. Error			
1	(Constant)	4.617	.248		18.640	.000
		.085	.051	.105	1.658	.098
	16) Wrong methods of teaching teachers adopt are pointed out by supervisors during classroom visitation and this helps them to correct themselves and to perform well in their job.					
	17) Classroom visitation exposes teachers to innovations in teaching and as such helps them to perform well in their job.	-.042	.047	-.052	-.885	.377
	18) Lesson notes and lesson plans are corrected during classroom visitations by the supervisor aid teachers job performance.	-.416	.056	-.383	-7.374	.000
	19) Classroom visitation by supervisors prevents teachers from being truants and as such have chances of doing their work well.	-.059	.057	-.069	-1.038	.300
	20) The difficulties that teachers encounter in classrooms are discovered during classroom visitation and this helps them to solve such problems as to perform well in the job.	.015	.046	.020	.325	.745
a. Dependent Variable: 1) During classroom visitations supervisors are able to point out to teachers certain wrong methods of teaching they use.						

The estimated constant coefficient analysis for classroom visitation was significant. Classroom variables such as supervisors being able to point out to teachers certain wrong methods of teaching they use, helping teachers to know some innovations in teaching, having chances of seeing and correcting teachers' lesson plans and lesson notes, helping to check truancy among teachers and helping to detect their difficulties in class control were seen as basis for the significant relationship and were significant at .000 and t-value of 14.479.

Hypothesis Two (H₀₂): There is no significant relationship between clinical supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

Table 6: Linear Regression Analysis of the relationship between clinical supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State

Model Summary					
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics R Square Change
1	.516 ^a	.266	.255	.50650	.266

The model summary of the Linear regression analysis showed R .516^a, R² of .266 and an Adjusted R Square of .255 of the item entered. Therefore, the value of R² = .266 x 100 = 26.% of the items of the variables explained the poor relationship between clinical supervision and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. This was as a result of inadequate use of clinical supervision by supervisors. What this represents was that the opinion of 74% might be caused by a number of other variables.

ANOVA ^a						
Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig. ^b
1	Regression	31.702	5	6.340	24.715	.000 ^b
	Residual	87.480	341	.257		
	Total	119.182	346			

- a. Dependent Variable: 6) The friendly nature of clinical supervision is an encouragement to teachers.
 b. Predictors: (Constant), 25) The intimacy that clinical supervision creates between supervisors and teachers helps teachers to perform well in their job., 23) The use of clinical supervision technique helps supervisors to plan with teachers and this aids teachers' job performance., 21) The friendly nature of clinical supervision technique encourages the supervisors to perform well in their job., 22) The use of clinical supervision technique removes fears from teachers and as such helps them to perform well in their job., 24) Clinical supervision technique helps teachers and supervisors to analyze teaching learning strategies, and this assists teachers to do their jobs.

The One-way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) presented the sum of square for the linear regression to be 31.702 and the residual of 87.480 and a degree of freedom of 5. The mean square for the linear regression was displayed as 6.340 and residual .257, with an F-value of 24.715 and a p-value of .000^b implied that clinical supervision is significantly related to teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

Model	Coefficients ^a				
	Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
	B	Std. Error	Beta		
(Constant)	2.817	.195		14.479	.000
21) The friendly nature of clinical supervision technique encourages the teachers to perform well in their job.	.486	.055	.501	8.893	.000
22) The use of clinical supervision technique removes fears from teachers and as such helps them to perform well in their job.	-.365	.052	-.399	-7.037	.000
23) The use of clinical supervision technique helps supervisors to plan with teachers and this aids teachers' job performance.	-.197	.042	-.249	-4.693	.000
24) Clinical supervision technique helps teachers and supervisors to analyze teaching learning strategies, and this assists teachers to do their jobs.	.086	.043	.115	2.018	.044
25) The intimacy that clinical supervision creates between supervisors and teachers helps teachers to perform well in their job.	.092	.029	.159	3.160	.002

a. Dependent Variable: 6) The friendly nature of clinical supervision is an encouragement to teachers.

The estimated constant coefficient analysis for clinical supervision was significant. Clinical supervision variables like; encouraging teachers to perform their job well, removes fears from teachers and as such helps them perform well, helps supervisors to plan with teachers, helps supervisor and teachers to analyze teaching strategies, creates intimacy between supervisors and teachers were seen as basis for the significant relationship and they were significant at .000 and t-value of 14.479.

Hypothesis Three (H₀₃): There is no significant relationship between holding conferences with teachers by the supervisor and the teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

Table 7: Linear Regression Analysis of the relationship between holding conferences with teachers by supervisor and their job performance

Model Summary									
Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Change Statistics				
					R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change
1	.430 ^a	.185	.173	.50761	.185	15.445	5	341	.000

a. Predictors: (Constant), 30) Holding conferences with teachers gives them sense of recognition and makes them perform well in their job., 27) Conferencing with teachers before and after their lesson delivery helps them in their professional growth and development., 28) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor helps to build positive relation between them and also helps their job performance., 29) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor helps to detect classroom problems as to solve them, and this helps them to perform well in their job., 26) Supervisors having conference with the teachers before the actual classroom activities helps teachers to do their work well.

The model summary of the linear regression analysis showed an R of .430^a, R² of .185 and an Adjusted R Square of .173 of the items entered. Therefore, the value of $R^2 = .185 \times 100 = 19\%$ of the items of the variables explained the poor relationship between holding conferences with teachers by supervisors and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. This was as a result of inadequate use of conferences by supervisors. What this represents was that the opinion of 81% might be caused by a number of other variables.

ANOVA^a

Model		Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	19.898	5	3.980	15.445	.000 ^b
	Residual	87.866	341	.258		
	Total	107.764	346			

a. Dependent Variable: 11) Having conference with teachers before and after classroom teaching learning process is needed for their professional growth.

b. Predictors: (Constant), 30) Holding conferences with teachers gives them sense of recognition and makes them perform well in their job., 27) Conferencing with teachers before and after their lesson delivery helps them in their professional growth and development., 28) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor helps to build positive relation between them and also helps their job performance., 29) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor helps to detect classroom problems as to solve them, and this helps them to perform well in their job., 26) Supervisors having conference with the teachers before the actual classroom activities helps teachers to do their work well.

The One-way Analysis of Variance (ANOVA) presented the sum of square for the linear regression to be 19.898 and that of residual 87.866 and a degree of freedom of 5. The mean square for the linear regression was displayed as 3.980 and residual of .258, with an F-value of 15.445 and p-value of .000^b implied that holding conferences with teachers by supervisors is significantly related to teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State.

Coefficients^a						
Model		Unstandardized Coefficients		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		B	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	4.122	.207		19.868	.000
	26) Supervisors having conferences with the teachers before the actual classroom activities helps teachers to do their work well.	-.208	.054	-.212	-3.849	.000
	27) Conferencing with teachers before and after their lesson delivery helps them in their professional growth and development.	.014	.032	.021	.434	.665
	28) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor helps to build positive relation between them and also helps their job performance.	-.026	.035	-.040	-.740	.460
	29) Conferencing with teachers by the supervisor helps to detect classroom problems as to solve them, and this helps them to perform well in their job.	-.214	.037	-.304	-5.772	.000
	30) Holding conferences with teachers gives them sense of recognition and makes them perform well in their job.	.232	.032	.390	7.253	.000

a. Dependent Variable: 11) Having conference with teachers before and after classroom teaching learning process is needed for their professional growth.

The estimated constant coefficient analysis for holding conferences with teachers by supervisors was significant. Holding conferences with teachers by supervisors variables like having conferences with teachers before the actual classroom activities help teachers do their work, helps them in their professional growth and development, helps teachers build positive relationship with supervisors, helps to detect classroom problems as to solve them, were seen as basis for the significant relationship and they were significant at .000 and the t-value of 19.868.

DISCUSSION

In discussing the findings of this study, the researcher has followed the order of data analyzed using relevant literature to support the findings and results.

Research question one is how classroom visitations by supervisors influence teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. The results from the respondents answers with the cumulated mean of 3.33 and standard deviation of 0.70 indicated strong relationship between classroom visitation and teachers' job performance. This implied that

classroom visitation enables teachers to improve on their job performance. This is in line with the views of Sudarjat, Abdullah and Sunaryo (2015) who in their study on the influence of supervision, leadership and motivation discovered that supervision, leadership and motivation influence teachers' performance up to 72.4%, 72% and 77.2% respectively. It is also in line with Jared (2011) who stated the need for classroom visits by supervisors for teachers' improvement. Implicitly, teachers need classroom supervision which is the main goal of classroom visitation by the supervisor to perform well in their job.

Research question two is how clinical supervision relates to teachers job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. The results from the respondents' answers having a cumulated mean of 3.23 and standard deviation of 0.67 disclosed strong relationship between the use of clinical supervision by supervisors and teachers' job performance. Obviously, clinical supervision aims at helping teachers improve on their teaching methods which indirectly improve students' learning. This supports Syaeful (2006) who opined that supervision is an assisted effort given to teachers while performing their professional duties so that they can help students learning.

Research question three is on the influence of holding conferences with teachers by the supervisors and teachers' job performance. The result from the respondents' answers having a cumulative mean of 3.34 and standard deviation of 0.70 also indicated strong relationship between holding conferences with teachers by supervisors and teachers' job performance. During conferences, teachers receive directives on how best to do their job. This is supported by the view of Fafioye (2004), Nwokafor (2005) and Marchard (2006) cited in Leigba (2010) who opined that supervision has to do with giving direction and control to a subordinate staff by the superior staff. So the main aim of holding conferences with teachers by supervisors is to give teachers good sense of direction in their job.

Hypothesis one which states that there is no significant relationship between classroom visitation of supervisors and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary school in Rivers State. The results from the respondents revealed that classroom visitation by supervisors gives teachers the opportunities to take corrections with regards to their wrong approaches to teaching learning activities thereby making them to perform better. This was made known in the significant level of .000 and the study's t-value of 18.640. This is in line with Anderea (n.d) view that classroom observation can provide administrators the opportunity to evaluate inequities in the classroom as well as improve teaching practice. Also supporting this view Waxman (2020) opined that classroom observation improves teaching practice as important information that have implication for teaching practice are gathered during classroom observation.

Hypothesis two which states that there is no significant relationship between clinical supervision technique and teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State, was rejected because clinical supervision technique is significantly related to teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. This is supported by the significant level of .000 and the study's t-value of 14.479. This finding is in line with Valoo et al. (2013) views that clinical supervision helps teachers to improve teaching and learning to be more understanding. Valoo et al. (2013) further stated that clinical supervision can also be used as guidance for teaching and learning improvement by school inspectorates

Hypothesis three which states that there is no significant relationship between holding conferences with teachers by the supervisors and teachers' job performance was rejected because holding conferences with the teachers before the actual classroom teaching is significantly

related to teachers' job performance in public senior secondary schools in Rivers State. This is indicated by the significant level of .000 and t-value of 19.868. This is in line with Nwankwoala (2016) opinion that holding conferences with teachers before and after teaching learning exercise helps the supervisor in giving feedback to the teachers with regards to their degree of performance for possible correction of wrongly used methods of teaching.

CONCLUSION

This research has highlighted important findings regarding the relationships between instructional supervision and teachers' job performance in the Nigerian school system. The study found out that supervisory techniques (classroom visitation, clinical supervision, holding conferences with teachers and many other techniques are significantly related to teachers' job performance. Further investigation revealed that supervision is a vital tool in school administration. As such, principals and headmasters who neglect their supervisory roles will hardly achieve maximum goals of education. It was also discovered that apart from instructional activities, every other aspect of the school function should regularly be supervised to avoid mismanagement of school facilities and properties. This implies that the school head as the internal supervisor must be very active to this responsibility of school supervision. There is also need for external supervisors from the Schools Board to regularly conduct supervision in schools without compromise.

Recommendations

In line with the objectives of this study the following recommendations are hereby made:

- Supervisors should regularly conduct classroom visitations where they can observe teachers during instructional process as to help them improve on their performance.
- Supervisors should employ clinical supervisory technique as it gives more room for team work and friendly interaction between supervisors and teachers. The use of this technique removes fears from teachers and makes them relaxed as they do their work in the classroom.
- Supervisors who may be from the Schools Board and even the school heads should always create time to hold conferences with the teachers as this gives them the opportunities to present their difficulties before the supervisors for better solutions.
- Supervisors should make use of other techniques of supervision, like demonstration technique, research technique, micro-teaching technique, etc. during supervision.
- Supervisors should cultivate spirit of team work during supervision to help teachers realize lesson objectives.
- Supervisors should not only find faults with the teachers, rather be more friendly as this makes teachers to perform better in their job.
- Newly employed teachers should often be supervised so that they can acquire more skills of teaching.

This study assessed the relationship between instructional supervision and teachers' job performance in the Nigerian school system with focus on Rivers State. It has so far revealed that supervision is a vital tool to educational administrators and school management. Since it was

carried out in Rivers State, it can still be replicated in other states of Nigeria for a wider perspective. The influence of other elements of the classroom like classroom discipline, environment, and climate on both students and teachers' performance can as well be investigated. This study therefore serves as a clarion call on school management to ensure that supervision is regularly conducted in schools to ensure the timely attainment of set education goals.

REFERENCES

- Abama, E. A. (2002). Educational supervision at the school level. In G. O. Akpa (Ed.). *The 21st Abraham* (Eds.). *Introduction to teaching profession*. Harey Publication.
- Anderea, H. (n.d). *The advantages of classroom observation*. Ichejun Publications.
- Fafunwa, A. B. (1974). *History of education in Nigeria*. George Allen & Unwin.
- FRN (2014). *National Policy on Education*. NERDC.
- Nwankwoala, H. N. L. (2016). *Fundamental facts in educational and supervision*. Harey Publication.
- Nwankwoala, H. N. L. (2016). *School mapping, plant and classroom management*. Harey Publication.
- Jared, N. B. (2011). *Influence of head teachers' general and instructional supervisory practices*. John Wiley & Son.
- Leigha, M. B. (2010). Teacher supervision and Inspection. In Adiele, E.E., Leigha, M.B., & L.N. *Management Perspective*, 3(3) 88-92.
- Oyewole, B. K., & Ehinola, G. B. (2014). Relevance of instructional supervision in the achievement. Pp 146-152.
- Rue, L. W., & Byars, L. L. (2007). *Supervision, Key Link to Productivity*. McGraw Hill. P. Schermerhorn, J. R., Hunt, J.R.N., Osborn, & Uhl-Bien, M.(2010). *Organization behaviour*.
- Schermerhorn, J. R., Hunt, J. R. N., Osborn, & Uhl-Bien, M. (2010). *Organization behaviour* .
- Sudarjat, J., Abdullah, T., & Sunaryo, W. (2015). Supervision, leadership, and working motivation.
- Sudarjat, J., Abdullah, T., & Sunaryo, W. (2015). Supervision, leadership, and working motivation Syaiful, S. (2006) Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah dan Masyarakat. Nimas Multima, pp. 25.
- Syaiful, S. (2006). Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah dan Masyarakat. Jakarta: Nimas Multima, pp. 25. Teacher Motivation in Public Basic Schools in Anomabo Education Circuit.
- Udo, U., & Akpa, G. O. (2001). *Management for Quality Education in Nigeria*. NAEAP.
- Veloo, A, Komuji, M.M., & Khalid, R. (2013). The effects of clinical supervision on teaching performance of secondary school teachers. DOI:10.1016/J.sbpro.2013.09.148
- Waxman, H. (2020). Classroom observation, purposes of classroom observation, limitations of classroom observation, new Direction. education.stateuniversity.com>pages>classroom-obs.www.asianonlinejournals.com.